



AN ANALYSIS OF RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN ENGLISH AND URDU READING SKILLS OF SECONDARY SCHOOL STUDENTS IN MULTAN

¹Binish Iqbal, ²Dr. Irfan Bashir

¹PST, Govt. Higher Secondary School, Piran Ghaib, Multan

²Assistant Professor, University of Management and Technology, Lahore

ABSTRACT

In perspective of analyzing Cummings' inter dependence hypothesis, this study mainly aimed at to find out correlation between Urdu and English reading comprehension. A mixed method research design was adopted to achieve the objectives of the study, as the data related to this study was both qualitative and quantitative in nature. Four researcher made tools used to gather quantitative and qualitative data included Urdu Reading Comprehension Test, an English Reading Comprehension Test, Questionnaires for English and Urdu Language Teachers and interview protocol. Data also included BISE results for 9th class in the subjects of Urdu and English. One thousand (1000) clustered sampled students (500 males, 500 females) were administered Urdu and English Reading Comprehension Tests while BISE results of the same students in the subjects of Urdu and English were also collected. Questionnaires were administered to 150 randomly selected Urdu and English Language teachers of these students (60 male, 90 female). Results of the study show that there is negative relationship between Urdu and English Reading Comprehension but there is positive but weak correlation between achievement scores on Urdu and English subjects in view of BISE results. Results of the questionnaire survey/interview show that teachers of Urdu and English use grammar translation method and lecture method in teaching their subjects.

Keywords: reading comprehension, Urdu, English, Correlation, Secondary school

To cite this paper: Iqbal, B. & Bashir, I. (2021). An analysis of relationship between English and Urdu reading skills of secondary school students in Multan. *Competitive Education Research Journal (CERJ)*, 2 (1), pages 13-25

INTRODUCTION

Any language includes certain aptitudes, for instance standardization in, talking, perusal and composing. Perusal ability assumes a major operate in language ability. Relationship of ability in mother language and therefore the resulting language has been a section of enthusiasm for language specialists for a few times. An investigation of this relationship will facilitate in grip bound language instructing strategies that will bring on higher English perusal ability within the second language students.

Learning understanding incorporates 2 degrees of getting ready, low-level handling, and elevated level handling. Low-level getting ready includes linguistics handling that happens once we encipher the importance of a word and relate it to comparable words. Elevated level getting ready includes basic and speech sound acknowledgment, the handling of sentence and syllable structure and their connected sounds. In each of this cycle's reliance might develop into a central purpose in making perusal ability in second language understudies. Reliance evaluations are represented as; the investigation of Urdu perusal power with English perusing ability at auxiliary level understudies. Urdu is our native language and students are acceptable in their local language as distinction with the next language.

Objectives of the Study

The main objectives of this study were these;

- 1. To find out correlation between Urdu and English reading comprehension scores.
- 2. To determine the relationship of Urdu comprehension with the overall scores gained in Urdu subject.
- 3. To point out the relationship of English comprehension with the overall scores gained in English subject.

Researcher Questions

This study was conducted to find out the answers to the following search questions;

- 1. How Urdu and English Reading skills correlate with each other?
- 2. What is the relationship of Urdu comprehension with overall scores gained in Urdu?
- 3. What is the relationship of English comprehension with overall scores gained in English?

Literature Review

Students of English language as second language learners are those students who are unable to communicate fluently in English, who mostly come from non-English speaking environment and

who require specialized instructions in English language. This gives rise to the area of second language learning and acquisition.

Second language learners may be involved in using English in wide range of situations such as chatting with friends, shopping for matters from market, asking instructions within side the street, discussing a hassle in tutorial, giving a seminar presentation and so on. To communicate effectively in another language i.e. English variety of tools are needed. Communication is a complex activity, even in our first language, and can cause difficulties for anyone engaged in it. Second language students may not remember the exact words or expression in which they want to communicate. In this case, they want to undertake certainly considered one among a set of verbal exchange strategies, which contain locating any other manner of expressing the favored which mean in unique forms. There are numerous problems that have an effect on the students' mastering English as a second language.

These factors may come from many components including social environmental issues, the difference of culture etc.,

There are some factors that affect the learners in learning English language which are presented by Normazidah, Koo, and Hazita (2012). (01, 02)

- 1. English is considered as a difficult subject.
- 2. English language learning depends on the English subject teachers.
- 3. There is no any kind of support to use English language in daily routine.
- 4. There are limited opportunities for the students to use the English outside the classroom.
- 5. There is limited vocabulary of English language for the students and lack of English reading material.
- 6. Lack of motivation for the scholars to analyze English language.
- 7. There is negative attitude of the scholars toward land language learning.

Researchers in the field of psychology and education, especially language learning, consider a number of psychological explanations that mean different meanings from different contexts and perspectives. (Alhmali, 2007). From a moral point of view, Montano and Kasprzyk (2008) argue that, "Attitude is determined by individual beliefs about the consequences or moral character (moral beliefs)," weighted by evaluations of those outcomes or attributes. Therefore, a person who holds firmly to the belief that the most important consequences of moral degradation will be

morally sound. On the other hand, a person who holds firmly to the belief that the most important consequences of moral degradation will be the result of a negative attitude.

Reid (2003) stated, "Attitude is important to us because it cannot be properly separated from the subject." Attitude is considered an important factor affecting language performance (Visser, 2008). Success in the target language depends not only on the ability to read, but also on the learner's perceptions of language learning. This means that the language of learning should be spoken primarily as a social and psychological phenomenon rather than as a mere literary one. Kiptui and Mbugua investigated that the negative attitudes towards English were the main and psychological factors that leading to the poor performance of the English language in Kenyan high schools. (05, 06)

In 1992, B. Baker proposed a complete theoretical model, focusing on the importance of conducting psychological research in the field of language learning. Baker (192) states, "In the life of a language, concepts in this language appear to be essential to language recovery, preservation, decay or death." Recently, De Bot. ET. Al. (2005) argue that language academics, researchers and students ought to acknowledge that top motivation and positive angle by learners promotes second acquisition. Therefore, if a student does not have the interest and tendency to find the target language to communicate with others, the student will develop a negative attitude and will not be motivated and motivated to learn the language. Therefore, students' attitudes can contribute to language learning because it can affect their performance in acquiring the target language. (06, 07)

Theoretical background of Language Learning

There are various theories and hypotheses about the second language learning that how students learn the second language. There are several kinds of researches about second language learning which are closely related to different kinds of disciplines such as linguistics, psycholinguistics, sociolinguistics and most of the theories about the second language that can be identified having roots in one of them. There are some theories about the second language learning.

For second language learning, attaining the accurate meaning is the most important task for the students. Meanings are the most important part of language, not the exotic sounds or elegant sentence structure. There are several types of meanings, lexical, (Lexical meanings are the meaning that is stored in our mental lexicon). Grammatical, (Grammatical meaning comes into consideration when calculating the meaning of a sentence).

Semantic, (Semantic and pragmatic meaning are those which are mostly depends on the context) meaning is word meaning), which requires knowledge of the world, for example, when someone asks on the phone, "Is there Aslam"? These words clearly state that the main focus is on knowing that the person needed (Aslam) is present to speak and not his physical presence. All words that mean to contribute to the acquisition of meaning usually have a combined sound language. (Anderson, J. R. 1992). (07)

Socio-cultural theory was developed by Wertsch in 1985, this theory was discovered from the work of Lev Vygotsky and the Vygostk in Moscow from the 1920s. Sociocultural theory explained that the notion of the function of human mental is participating from cultural meditation into social activities.

In the competition model is considered as it is one of the major cognitive theories, which analyze that how learners organize the knowledge of language learning that is based on the analysis of how can speaker analyzed the meaning of different sentence structure. English speakers depend on word order, the German speakers used morphological harmony, and the understanding of the status of noun referents, and stress, and the Italian speakers depends on the agreement and stress. The competitive model states that people use language clues to get meaning from a language, rather than relying on language universities. According to this theory, when they acquire a second language, students acquire competitive environments and have to decide which the best way to get the meaning is. (Anderson, J.R. (1992) (07)

Declarative model is used to recognize how language knowledge can be stored. This model is dependable with a similarity made in general cognitive science between the storage and revival of facts and on the other hand considerate how to carry out operations. The declarative knowledge depends on the arbitrary in sequence, for instance irregular forms of verb that are stored in the declarative memory of the brain. Quite the opposite, knowledge about the language' rules that the grammatical words in an order of procedural information and it is stored in the procedural memory. (Anderson, 1992)

The Interdependence Hypothesis and Reading Skill

The Linguistic Interdependence Hypothesis was founded by Cummins (1978), expresses that information on tongue (L1) may even be successfully moved all through the strategy of learning a subsequent language (L2). The data and language aptitudes of L1 that a child has may even be

helpful in building up the relating abilities in L2. The theory of unfamiliar reliance has been officially enunciated as follows (Cummins, 1981)

To the degree that guidance in Lx is viable in advancing capability in Lx, move of this capability to Ly can happen gave there's sufficient presentation to Ly (either in school or condition) In solid terms, what this standard suggests that is that in, suppose, Urdu-English bilingual program assumed for local speakers, English guidance that creates English perusing and composing aptitudes isn't simply creating English aptitudes; it's moreover building up a more profound hypothetical and jargon capacity that is effectively related to the occasion of ability in the regular In something else, though the surface viewpoints (e.g., elocution, certainty) of changed dialects are obviously confine, there is a hidden intellectual/scholarly experience that is ordinary transversely dialects. This normal basic capacity makes possible the exchange of mental component, instructional exercise or education related capacity from one language to an additional language. In aggregation to its applications to second learning programs, the commonality speculation furthermore attempted to report for associated wonders possibly the never-endingly goodish relationships somewhere in the range of s L1 and L2 understanding aptitudes. These relationships endure even transversely reasonably detached dialects (e.g., Chinese and English) (Cummins et al., 1984; Genesee, 1979) telling that the basic capacity should be constrained to be arranged not while phonetic capacity anyway moreover in dynamic jargon. subsequently, at stretches the instance of sorted out dialects that are significant from comparative asset of dialects (e.g., Greek and Latin at spans the instance of Sentiment dialects), move can joins each etymological and digest fundamentals however, at spans the instance of dissimilar dialects, move can comprise in the principle of hypothetical and mental element nuts and bolts (e.g., learning systems), to explain, choose the logical origination of synthetic change, in dialects love Spanish, French, and English, the articulation is come about because of Greek roots, and an understudy who is receptive to the articulation in Lx and comprehends the thought can move each phonetic and digest nuts and bolts from Lx to By differentiation, partner exceedingly in a vary situation of frightfully disparate securing, alone the theoretical parts are adaptable. These records for the upper relationships realistic across the same as contrasted and completely totally various dialects (Genesee, 1979).

More modern investigation has uncovered that totally various choices of capacity and preproficiency aptitudes move across dialects (e.g., synchronic phonetics mindfulness; Geva, 2000). In survey, semantics situation relies upon the 5 sorts of move are attainable: 1. the exchange of unique parts (for instance, discerning idea of photosynthesis) 2. The second exchange of metaintellectual 3. The third assortment of move is commonsense parts of language use (for instance, availability to wish chances 4. The fourth assortment of move is exact jargon basics (data of the recommends of photo in photosynthesis) 5. The fifth and afterward the last very exchange is synchronic phonetics awareness - the information that words are made out of discrete sounds. Xiangying jiang concentrated on The entirety of Spirits' Day, Gregorian schedule month 2011 regarding the matter The Part of tongue capacity and Second Language Capability in Second Language Perusing. This examination analyzed the connection of first language (L1) aptitude, second language (L2) capability, and L2 perusing appreciation with 246 Chinese school students. L1 capacity and L2 capability were estimated with school affirmation tests in Chinese and English. L2 perusing perception was estimated with the perusing appreciation area of a TOEFL and an analyst created section understanding check. L1 capacity was discovered to be tolerably connect with L2 language capability, as was L2 language capability with L2 understanding appreciation. Relapse examinations relentless that L2 language capability represented 27%-39% of difference in L2 understanding appreciation, while L1 capacity represented less than 6% of These discoveries affirmed that L2 language capability contributes up to 30% of the fluctuation in L2 understanding execution, yet didn't offer evidence that L1 capacity contributes up to with respect to 20% of the change in L2 perusing. C. Missionary delegate, Jeffrey R. Harring Silverman concentrated in 2017 on the point Etymological commonality between Spanish language and Germanic perusing. This examination investigate impacts of Spanish oral language aptitudes on the occasion of English oral language capacity and perusing appreciation among 156 bilingual Latino children in second through fifth grade whose tongue was Spanish and whose subsequent language utilizing an accomplice successive vogue (partner 1: second third grade; associate 2: third fourth grade; companion 3: fourth-fifth grade), they numerable evaluation 2-5 directions of English oral language They surveyed whether or not or not early degrees of Spanish jargon and sentence structure anticipated; (an) understudies' evaluation English oral language abilities and understanding perception; and (b) studentsgrade 2-5. Development in these Outcomes indicated that Spanish punctuation expected all evaluation five English oral language abilities and understanding cognizance. Spanishsyntax was also completely identifying with development in understanding perception. Spanish language

structure was moreover completely identifying with development in English phonetics information. Spanish jargon wasn't with respect to any English oral language aptitudes or understanding results. On paper, results suggest that investigations of "move" from Spanish to English are conceivable qualified by the builds underneath study and in this manner the implies that by which they're operationalized. Instructionally, operational with bilingual students around issues identifying with Spanish and English grammar has suggestions for bilingually and metaetymologically arranged instructing approaches that fabricate semantic information and advance understanding perception.

Research Methodology

Co-relational research design was used in this study. All the secondary level students were treated as the population of the study. All the students studying in Multan division were the target population of this study. While the secondary level students of Multan city were considered as the sampling frame. Clustered sampled students of 9th class from randomly selected 10 Government Secondary Schools (Male=5, Female=5) were treated as the sample for this study. All the teachers teaching subjects of English and Urdu in these schools were included in the sample of the study for interview. All the students were given Urdu and English Comprehension tests (reliability=.89 and .88 respectively), board results (marks of English and Urdu) were also used to find certain correlations.

Table 1
Sample of the Study

| S. No. | School | Teachers | | Total | Students | | Total |
|---------|-------------|----------|--------|--------|----------|--------|-------|
| S. 1NO. | School | Male | Female | 1 Otai | Male | Female | Totai |
| | | English | Urdu | | | | |
| 1. | GGHSS Piran | 6 | 7 | 13 | | 100 | 100 |
| | Ghaib | | | | | | |
| 2. | GGHSS | 6 | 8 | 14 | | 100 | 100 |
| | Moonlight | | | | | | |
| 3. | GGHS | 4 | 5 | 9 | | 100 | 100 |
| | Sameejhabad | | | | | | |
| 4. | Govt Muslim | 7 | 6 | 13 | | 100 | 100 |

| | Girls H | ligh | | | | | |
|-----|---------------|---------|---|----|-----|-----|-----|
| | School | | | | | | |
| 5. | Govt Girls Id | qbal 6 | 6 | 12 | | 100 | 100 |
| | Secondary | | | | | | |
| | School | | | | | | |
| 6. | GHSS | 6 | 6 | 12 | 100 | | 100 |
| | Sameejhabad | 1 | | | | | |
| 7. | Govt. | 6 | 7 | 13 | 100 | | 100 |
| | JamiaAlum | | | | | | |
| | High School | | | | | | |
| 8. | Govt. H | High 7 | 7 | 14 | 100 | | 100 |
| | School | | | | | | |
| | Aamkhas Ba | gh | | | | | |
| 9. | Govt. M | illat 6 | 8 | 14 | 100 | | 100 |
| | High School | | | | | | |
| 10. | Govt. Mus | slim 7 | 6 | 13 | 100 | | 100 |
| | Boys H | Iigh | | | | | |
| | School | | | | | | |

Data Analysis

Pearson momentum correlation formula was applied to find correlations between Urdu and English scores.

Research Question

How Urdu and English Reading skill correlate with each other?

Table 2
Gender-wise correlation of Urdu and English Reading Skills (N=1000)

| S. No. | Category | Gender | Mean Scores | | Correlation |
|--------|-------------------|--------|-------------|---------|-------------|
| | | | Urdu | English | - |
| 1. | Comprehension | Male | 7.79 | 4.69 | -0.19 |
| | Test | Female | 8.60 | 6.31 | -0.03 |
| 2. | 9th Class Results | Male | 42.21 | 37.33 | -0.08 |

| Female | 46.81 | 35.59 | -0.07 | |
|--------|-------|-------|-------|--|

Table 2 shows the negative correlation between Urdu and English reading skill. The average scores comprehension tests of male students in Urdu and English subjects are 7.79 and 4.69 and it shows negative correlation which is -0.19, on the other hand average scores of female students are 8.60 and 6.13 it also show negative correlation which is -0.03. The average scores of overall results of subjects English and Urdu of male students are 42.81 and 37.33 it has also negative correlation -0.08 and the average scores results of female students are 46.81 and 35.59 these results shows negative correlation which is -0.07.

Research Question

What is the relationship of Urdu comprehension with overall scores gained in Urdu? Table 3

Correlation of Urdu Reading Skill

| S. | Category | Average score | Correlation |
|-----|-------------------------------|---------------|-------------|
| No. | | | |
| 1. | Comprehension | 8.2 | |
| | Test | | 0.08 |
| 2. | 9 th Class Results | 39 | |

The above table 3 show the average score of comprehension test of subject Urdu which is **8.2** and the average scores of result Urdu which is **39** and it shows the positive correlation between Urdu reading comprehension test and the results of Urdu subject that is **0.08**.

Research Question 4:

What is the relationship of English comprehension with overall scores gained in English?

Correlation of English Reading Skill

| | | | N=1000 |
|-----|---------------|---------------|-------------|
| S. | Category | Average score | Correlation |
| No. | | English | _ |
| 1. | Comprehension | 5.50 | |
| | Test | | |
| | | | |

| 2. | 9th Class Results | 36.4 | 0.14 |
|----|-------------------|------|------|
| | | | |

The above table no. 4.7 show the average score of comprehension test of subject English which is 5.50 and the average scores of result English which is 36.4 and it shows the positive correlation between English reading comprehension test and the results of English subject that is 0.14.

FINDINGS

Following were the findings of the study on the basis of results;

- 1. There is negative Correlation between English Reading Comprehension and Urdu Reading Comprehension Test.
- 2. The average scores of English Reading Comprehension Tests show the positive correlation with overall scores of English
- 3. The average scores of Urdu Reading Comprehension Tests show the positive correlation with overall scores of Urdu.
- 4. Teachers use grammar translation method, literary text, communicative approach and direct method in teaching English and Urdu subject.

Following conclusions were reached after results and findings of the study; Whereas the results of English reading comprehension tests and Urdu reading comprehension test show the negative correlation. And the gender-wise correlation between the English reading comprehension test and Urdu reading comprehension test is also negative. On the other hand the average scores of English reading comprehension tests show the positive correlation, and the average scores of Urdu reading comprehension tests also show the positive correlation. And the teachers' questionnaire demonstrates that they all are agreeing that they mostly used literary text and direct method to teach the text from Urdu books to teach them Urdu text. And they use grammar translation methods, communicative approach, and direct method to teach the students English reading.

Recommendations

- 1. The subject teachers should also teach the students by using such methods which may prove helpful for the students to improve their reading skill in English and Urdu.
- 2. Language teachers should use activity based learning techniques for improving language skills in students.

- 3. The language teachers should also use motivational techniques to make actively participate in language class.
- 4. Similar research may also be conducted by using experimental research design for assessing the students' performance level in more authentic way.
- 5. In the same way next research may also be conducted on rural areas schools 'students, comparison of rural and urban schools and private schools can also be included in the study.
- 6. Relationship of mother language of students may also be analyzed in doing research on achievement in Urdu and English reading skill.
- 7. Other language skills like writing, speaking and listening may also be included in future research.

REFERENCES

- Cummins, J. (1981). The role of primary language development. OUP
- Genesee, F. (1979). Acquisition of reading skills in immersion programs. *Foreign Language Annals*, 12, 71–77.
- Abbas, F., Farid, M. F., Iqbal, A., & Parveen, S. (2020). Impact of Using Newspapers Reading in Improving English Reading Proficiency: A Study of Pakistani University Students. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*, 14(10), 223-232.
- Anderson, J. R. (1992). "Automaticity and the ACT* theory". *American journal of psychology*. 105(2): 165-180. Doi: 10.2307/1423026. JSTOR 1423026. PMID 1621879
- Allington, Richard L. & Cunningham, Patricia M. (1998.) Classrooms That Work.
- Bhatti, A.M., Abbas, F. & Rana, A.M.K. (2020). An Empirical study of learning styles used by undergraduate English learners in public sector colleges in Pakistan. *Elementary Education Online* 19 (3), 1864-1864.
- Geva, E. (2000). Issues in the assessment of reading disabilities in L2 children--beliefs and research eveidence. *Dyslexia*, 6, 13–28.
- Nazir, S., Abbas, F., & Naz, F. (2020). Historical development of orthography in English and impact of computer-mediated communication (CMC) on the emerging

- orthographic patterns in English. *PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology*, 17(11), 162-175.
- Cummins, J., Bismilla, V., Chow, P., Cohen, S., Giampapa, F., Leoni, L., Sandhu, P., & Sastri, P. (2005) Affirming identity in multilingual classrooms. *Educational Leadership*, 63(1), 38–43
- Chow, P., & Cummins, J. (2003). Valuing multilingual and multicultural approaches to learning. In S. R. Schecter & J. Cummins (Eds.), *multilingual education in practice: Using diversity as a resource* (pp. 32–61). Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann.
- Cummins, J. (1991). Interdependence of first- and second-language proficiency in bilingual children. In E. Bialystok (Ed.), *Language processing in bilingual children* (pp. 70–89). Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press
- Cummins, J. (2001). Negotiating identities: Education for empowerment in a diverse society (2nd Ed.). Los Angeles: California Association for Bilingual Education.
- Koo Yew Lie. (2008). Language, culture and literacy; meaning making in global contexts, Bangi: Penerbit Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia.
- Lee King Siong, Hazita&Koo Yew Lie. (2010). *Investigating the undergraduate* experience of assessment in higher education. GEMA online journalof Language Studies.
- Montano, D.E., & Kasprzk, D. (2008). Theory of reasoned action, theory of planned behavior, and the intedgrated behavioral model. In K.Glanz, B. Rimer & K. Viswanth (Eds.), *Health behavior and education: Theory, research, and practice* (pp.67-96). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass
- Tarar, I.A., Rana, A.M.K. & Abbas, F. (2020). Right to Education: Comparative Study of Constitutional Contours, Legislative Initiatives and Institutional Arrangements in India and Pakistan. *Elementary Education Online* 19 (3), 3365-3371.
- Pugh, A.K. (1978) SILENT Reading anintroduction to its study and teaching, London: Heinemamm Educational Books